

1 Dan Stormer, Esq. (CA Bar # 101967) (*pro hac vice*)  
2 Shaleen Ameeta Shanbhag (CA Bar # 301047) (*pro hac vice*)  
3 HADSELL STORMER & RENICK LLP  
4 128 N Fair Oaks Avenue  
5 Pasadena, CA 91103  
6 Telephone: (626) 585-9600  
7 Facsimile: (626) 577-7079  
8 Emails: [dstormer@hadsellstormer.com](mailto:dstormer@hadsellstormer.com)  
9 [sshanbhag@hadsellstormer.com](mailto:sshanbhag@hadsellstormer.com)

10 Kathleen E. Brody (AZ Bar No. 026331)  
11 Mitchell Stein Carey Chapman, PLC  
12 One Renaissance Square  
13 2 North Central Avenue, Suite 1450  
14 Phoenix, AZ 85004  
15 Telephone: (602) 388-8958  
16 Facsimile: (602)358-0291  
17 Email: [kathy@mscclaw.com](mailto:kathy@mscclaw.com)

18 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

19 [Additional counsel cont. on next page]

20 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
21 DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

22 Puente, an Arizona nonprofit corporation;	)	No. CV 18-2778-PHX-JJT
23 Poder in Action, an Arizona nonprofit	)	
24 corporation; Ira Yedlin; Janet Travis;	)	
25 Cynthia Guillen; Jacinta Gonzalez	)	<b>STIPULATION FOR VOLUNTARY</b>
26 Goodman, individually and as class	)	<b>DISMISSAL OF CERTAIN</b>
27 representatives,	)	<b>DEFENDANTS</b>
28	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	
v.	)	
City of Phoenix, a municipal corporation;	)	
Jeri L. Williams; Benjamin Moore;	)	
Douglas McBride; Robert Scott;	)	
Christopher Turiano; Glenn Neville; John	)	
Sticca; Lane White; Jeffrey Howell;	)	
George Herr, individually and in their	)	
official capacities; and Does 1-20.	)	
Defendants.	)	

1 Jared G. Keenan (AZ Bar # 027068)  
2 ACLU FOUNDATION OF ARIZONA  
3 3707 North 7th Street, Suite 235  
4 Phoenix, AZ 85014  
5 Telephone: (602) 532-0486  
6 Email: [dhill@acluaz.org](mailto:dhill@acluaz.org)  
7 [jkeen@acluaz.org](mailto:jkeen@acluaz.org)

8 Barrett S. Litt (CA Bar # 45527) (*pro hac vice*)  
9 KAYE, MCLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT, LLP  
10 975 E. Green Street  
11 Pasadena, CA 91106  
12 Telephone: (626) 844-7660  
13 Email: [Blitt@kmbllaw.com](mailto:Blitt@kmbllaw.com)

14 Paul L. Hoffman (CA Bar # 71244) (*pro hac vice*)  
15 John C. Washington (CA Bar # 315991) (*pro hac vice*)  
16 SCHONBRUN DESIMONE SEPLOW HARRIS &  
17 HOFFMAN, LLP  
18 200 Pier Ave., Ste. 226  
19 Hermosa Beach, CA 90254  
20 Email: [Jwashington.sshh@gmail.com](mailto:Jwashington.sshh@gmail.com)  
21 [hoffpaul@aol.com](mailto:hoffpaul@aol.com)

22 Neel Chatterjee (CA Bar # 173985) (*pro hac vice*)  
23 GOODWIN PROCTOR LLP  
24 601 Marshall Street  
25 Redwood City, CA 94063  
26 Telephone: (650) 752-3100  
27 Emails: [nchatterjee@goodwinlaw.com](mailto:nchatterjee@goodwinlaw.com)

28 Sean M. Galvin (NY Bar # 570313) (*pro hac vice*)  
GOODWIN PROCTOR LLP  
620 Eighth Avenue  
New York, NY 10018  
Emails: [seangalvin@goodwinlaw.com](mailto:seangalvin@goodwinlaw.com)

Cindy Panuco  
Joanna Elizabeth Adler (*pro hac vice*)  
Nisha Kashyap (*pro hac vice*)  
PUBLIC COUNSEL  
6120 S. Ardmore Avenue  
Los Angeles, CA 90005-2322  
Emails: [cpanuco@publiccounsel.org](mailto:cpanuco@publiccounsel.org)  
[jadler@publiccounsel.org](mailto:jadler@publiccounsel.org)  
[nkashyap@publiccounsel.org](mailto:nkashyap@publiccounsel.org)

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

1 Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 41(a)(2), Plaintiffs Puente, Poder in  
2 Action, Janet Travis, Ira Yedlin, Cynthia Guillen, and Jacinta Gonzalez Goodman  
3 (“Plaintiffs”) by and through their attorneys; and Defendants City of Phoenix, Chief Jeri  
4 L. Williams, Lieutenant Benjamin Moore, Sergeant Douglas McBride, Officer Robert  
5 Scott, Officer Christopher Turiano, Officer Glenn Neville, Officer John Sticca, Officer  
6 Lane White, Officer Jeffrey Howell, and Officer George Herr (“Defendants”), by and  
7 through their attorneys, stipulate as follows:

8 Plaintiffs and Defendants stipulate to dismissal with prejudice of Plaintiffs’ claims  
9 in their entirety against Defendants Officer Neville, Officer Sticca, and Officer White  
10 only.

11 In addition, Plaintiffs and Defendants stipulate to dismissal with prejudice of:

- 12 1. Plaintiffs Puente, Poder in Action, and Gonzalez Goodman’s claims against  
13 Defendants Officer Scott, Officer Turiano, Officer Howell, and Officer Herr.
- 14 2. Plaintiff Yedlin’s claims against Defendant Officer Turiano.
- 15 3. Plaintiff Travis’s claims against Defendants Officer Scott and Officer Herr.

16 Plaintiffs’ counsel have concluded, based on their review of the evidence, that the  
17 dismissal of these defendants is in the class’s best interest and that no notice or hearing is  
18 required because all classwide causes of action remain against the remaining defendants,  
19 leaving the class members’ litigation prospects unchanged as a practical matter.  
20 Defendants concur that no notice and hearing are required.

21 Each party will bear their own attorneys’ fees and costs.

22 DATED this 6th day of May, 2020.

23 MITCHELL | STEIN | CAREY | CHAPMAN, PC

24 By: /s/ Kathleen E. Brody

25 One Renaissance Square  
26 2 North Central Avenue, Suite 1450  
27 Phoenix, AZ 85004  
28

PUBLIC COUNSEL

Cindy Panuco

Nisha Kashyap

Joanna E. Adler

HADSELL STORMER & RENICK LLP

Dan Stormer

Shaleen Ameeta Shanbhag

KAYE, MCLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT,  
LLP

Barrett S. Litt

ACLU FOUNDATION OF ARIZONA

Jared G. Keenan

GOODWIN PROCTOR LLP

Neel Chatterjee

Julia W. Zhang

Sean M. Galvin

SCHONBRUN SEPLOW HARRIS &  
HOFFMAN, LLP

Paul L. Hoffman

John C. Washington

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.

By: /s/ Joshua M. Whitaker (with permission)

David B. Rosenbaum

Mary R. O'Grady

Joshua M. Whitaker

2929 N. Central Avenue, 21st Floor

Phoenix, AZ 85012

MANNING & KASS

ELLROD, RAMIREZ, TRESTER, LLP

Mildred K. O'Linn

Nishan J. Wilde

3636 N. Central Avenue, 11th Floor

Phoenix, AZ 85012

Attorneys for Defendants

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that on May 6, 2020, I electronically transmitted a PDF version of the attached document to the Clerk's Office using the CM/ECF System for filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to all CM/ECF registrants.

/s/ J. Greenwood